What is the future of work? A science mapping analysis

Monica Santana a,*, Manuel J. Cobo b

a University of Pablo de Olavide, Carretera de Utrera, Km1, 41013, Seville, Spain
b University of Cádiz, Avenida de la Universidad nº 10, 11519 Puerto Real, Cádiz, Spain

Article history:
Received 7 April 2019
Received in revised form 12 March 2020
Accepted 23 April 2020
Available online 7 May 2020

Keywords:
Future of work
digitalisation
telework
 gig work
SciMAT

ABSTRACT

This article aims to systematise and provide a structure for research into the Future of Work (FoW). We used SciMAT to conduct a science mapping analysis based on co-word bibliographic networks. The Web of Science (WoS) database was used for article retrieval, and a total of 2,286 documents were identified from 1959 to 2019. Our results are counterintuitive, as concerns over satisfaction, leadership values or corporate social responsibility (CSR) appear alongside traditional human resource management (HRM) themes, such as organisational commitment or careers, as well as more current FoW themes, such as the impact of technological change on employment, wage inequality, vulnerable workers, telework or talent management. In addition, we offer a classification of the most prolific FoW research themes and challenges into technological, social, economic and political categories.

© 2020 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

Technological, economic and socio-demographic shifts create new demands for organisations (Stone & Deakrick, 2015). The impact of technological factors on organisations have led to the publication of a wide variety of studies. Allen (2017) offers an interesting approach about different periods in history and lessons for the Future of Work (FoW) field. Manyika (2017) explains that new technology is now capable of learning and discovering patterns with important implications for jobs. Researchers and practitioners have focussed in particular on the impact of automation on organisations, although this is a narrow view and companies are now considering how jobs should be organised and developed to face future challenges (Stoepfgeshoff, 2018). Despite the increasing number of academic articles and information reports on the topic of the FoW (Deloitte, 2017; Spencer, 2018; Stoepfgeshoff, 2018; World Economic Forum, 2016), there is still a scope for development in this research field, as there is no clear understanding of the term ‘Future of Work’ (Bhattacharya & Nair, 2019; Stoepfgeshoff, 2018).

We aim to systematise and structure the wide variety of research areas within this field. Thus, our research questions are: What is FoW? What are the main tendencies and challenges of FoW?

In this sense, our study introduces a novel approach to mapping the FoW literature directly from the interaction of key terms. The objective was to analyse the thematic evolution of FoW research. To achieve this, we combined performance analysis and science mapping to detect and visualise conceptual subdomains, using a data science methodology and the SciMAT software (Cobo, López-Herrera, Herrera-Viedma, & Herrera, 2011a; 2011b, 2012). Science mapping applies a new perspective to reveal scientific limits and dynamic structures, using visualisation tools (Cobo et al., 2011a), thus we carried out a co-word analysis that constructs strategic diagrams to classify the detected themes. Our findings present a graphical vision of the FoW field, identifying the most important themes: wage inequality, telework, talent management, satisfaction, careers, employment and innovation. We also present the major FoW outcomes classified into technological, social, economic and political categories. This classification and outcomes will help to obtain a systematic comprehension of what FoW is. To date, no studies in this field have used science mapping and performance analysis.

In the following sections, we present an overview of the current state of FoW and a review of the literature on bibliometrics and science mapping. This is followed by an explanation of the methodological approach to our analysis. In the final sections, the findings and conclusions are presented.

* Corresponding author.
E-mail addresses: mstanher@upo.es (M. Santana), manueljesus.cobo@uca.es (M.J. Cobo).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.emj.2020.04.010
0263-2373/© 2020 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.
2. Theoretical framework

Regarding the research field of FoW, there is a lack of studies available in the literature (Bhattacharya & Nair, 2019). Allen (2017) acknowledges three crucial moments that provide important lessons for FoW research: the Industrial Revolution (1750–1830); the Western ascent to wealth (1830–1970) and the uncertain present (1970 onwards). However, Allen (2017) highlights the need to consider the impact of technological change across the world (in developed and developing countries), adding that, in developed countries during the Industrial Revolution, typical labour relations saw increased productivity, constant average wages and female unemployment, which then shifted towards more equal wages and more educated workers in the period of affluence in the West. The difference of the ‘uncertain present’ compared with other points in history is that artificial intelligence, robotics and autonomous systems have undergone spectacular developments; machines are now capable of learning and discovering patterns themselves, provoking significant concerns for human beings (Manylka, 2017). Spencer (2018), however, argues that work is likely to continue, despite and, indeed, because of the broader utilisation of new technology. In this sense, Autor (2015) also states that automation creates higher demands for labour and complements labour. The term FoW is in current usage in the management, organisational, leadership, political and economic literature (Allen, 2017; Spencer, 2018; Stone & Deadrick, 2015). Ballister and Elsheikhi (2018) assign five dimensions to FoW: the future of jobs (job creation, job destruction or the future workforce structure); job quality (future working conditions, sustainable social protection systems); wage and income inequality (average growth and distribution); social protection systems and industrial relations (how labour institutions evolve in this context). In addition, Anner, Pons-Vignon, and Rani (2019) highlight five dimensions to foster workers well-being and social cohesion, which are inequality, jobs, labour regulations, trade unions and social protection. However, there is no common understanding of the concept (Stoepfgeshoff, 2018), the classifications offered by Ballister and Elsheikhi (2018) and Anner et al. (2019) bring inspiring insights, as their five dimensions allude to the influence of technological changes and also to socioeconomic and political factors involved in the FoW.

With the emergence of new technologies, such as artificial intelligence, machine learning, robotics, data analytics, virtual reality and Internet of Things, individuals would lose their jobs, causing unemployment and leading to public disturbance (Bhattacharya & Nair, 2019). In this sense, Autor and Salomons (2018) explained that automation has not impacted labour-displacing, but it has decreased labour’s participation in added value. In addition, Acemoglu and Restrepo (2017) predict a negative impact of robots on labour and wages. According to the World Economic Forum, approximately 1.4 million people will lose their job by 2026, and termination of the job type will be the cause behind 70% of the cases (World Economic Forum, 2018). Hawskworth, Berriman, and Goel (2018) state that 30% of jobs (across 29 studied countries) will be at risk of automation by 2030, with the financial and insurance industry being at the highest potential risk of positions being replaced by technologies. Conversely, Arzt, Gregory, and Zierahn (2016) are less pessimistic and they estimate that around 10% of jobs are at risk of automation. They consider that this job automation’s predictions should observe the particular tasks in each position rather than the entire occupation. Indeed, variations in job composition within industries and differences in how tasks are organised within the same jobs will determine how a particular occupation is more susceptible to automation in some countries than in others (Gonzalez-Vazquez et al., 2019; Nedelkoska & Quintini, 2018). In 2013, Frey and Osborne predicted that 47% of US occupations were at risk of computerisation within 30 years; however, they emphasised that this scenario would depend on other variables, such as cost, regulatory issues, or political and social pressure. More recently, they added that this study was misunderstood, and that it has to be interpreted from a contextual and historical perspective (Frey, 2019). In fact, Frey (2019) considers that artificial intelligence will benefit employment, but that the positive effects of artificial intelligence may take longer than expected, leading governments to adopt mistaken decisions in the meantime. Spencer (2018) interestingly conveys that jobs will persist and that the problem will be linked to the deterioration of job quality, rather than to the loss of jobs; this author calls for wider changes in ownership to address the FoW. Thus, the FoW field is very piecemeal, with different subtopics (i.e. technological, economic, social and political). Understanding the diverse nature of this field of study from a systematic perspective, highlighting its major themes and evolution, represents the contribution we aim to bring to this debate.

In summary, the impact of technological improvements on jobs has been the focus of the FoW literature; however, other socioeconomic and political factors might also have a significant influence on this field. Analysing the challenges that the FoW is facing will improve our knowledge of it.

3. Methodology

The bibliometric methodology measures information and texts (Norton, 2001) and offers a robust statistical method to reach conclusions (Rosenthal, 1979). Bibliometric methods have explored the impact of authors, affiliations, conceptual maps, cluster and factor analysis, citation and co-citation (Daim, Rueda, Martin, & Gerdts, 2006). This article uses science mapping analysis to reflect the dynamic and structural characteristics of scientific research and to show the cognitive architecture of an academic field (Cobo, López-Herrera, Herrera-Viedma, & Herrera, 2011b; Mura, Longo, Micheli, & Bolzani, 2018).

Science mapping is a graphic representation of how knowledge areas, documents or authors are interrelated (Small, 1999) and there are various software techniques for obtaining bibliometric mapping analysis (Cobo et al., 2011b). SciMAT (Cobo, López-Herrera, Herrera-Viedma, & Herrera, 2012) combines science mapping and performance analysis techniques to study a research field and visualise and identify specific topics/themes or general thematic areas and their evolution. We used SciMAT to analyse a conceptual science mapping analysis based on co-word bibliographic networks (Batagelj & Cerinsek, 2013). To offer a rigorous analysis, we describe each step in the process. A science mapping analysis follows these stages: data search, data refinement, standardisation and creation of the network, map creation, analysis and visualisation and performance analysis (Fig. 1: Börner, Chen, & Boyack, 2005; Cobo et al., 2011b).

In the first stage (data search), we retrieved documents from the Web of Science (WoS) database (www.webofknowledge.com), which offers exhaustive coverage of the social sciences literature (Norris & Oppenheim, 2007). This study includes all the articles and reviews published on WoS in the fields of management, business and industrial labour relations. The keywords incorporated into the WoS search were obtained with the assistance of four full professors in the FoW field, following the insightful recommendations of this manuscript’s reviewers and observing keywords from the most relevant articles (see Table 1). The periods were selected dividing the last 10 years into two periods (2008–2014 and 2015–2019), as most FoW manuscripts were focussed on these periods. Then, we considered the previous 10-year period, i.e. 1998–2008, and we added publications on the FoW to the first
period, 1959–1997, prior to which there is no strong connection between the thematic networks.

In the data refinement and reduction stage, we scanned data to identify incorrect, duplicate or misspelled items. In the standardisation and creation stage, we used a co-occurrence network, which was then filtered to delete non-representative items. The network was standardised using the equivalence index. Then, we used simple centre algorithms to obtain the science map and its clusters (Coulter, Monarch, & Konda, 1998). In the analysis and visualisation stage, we obtained rich findings and connections from our research data, networks and maps, adopting the following stages for our study (Cobo et al., 2011a):

1. Representation of themes and thematic networks. At this stage, the detected themes are visualised using two distinct graphic tools: strategic diagrams and thematic networks (Cobo et al., 2011a). Each theme can be characterised by two dimensions (Callon, Courtial, & Laville, 1991): centrality and density. Centrality measures the degree of interaction of a network with other networks and can be seen as a measure of the importance of a theme in the development of a particular research field. Density observes the internal strength of the network and represents a measure of the theme’s development. Given both measures, a research field can be visualised as a set of research themes, mapped in a two-dimensional strategic diagram and classified into four groups (see Fig. 2): motor themes (well developed and important for the structure of the research field); specialised or peripheral themes (well-developed internal ties and unimportant external ties); emerging or disappearing themes (both weakly developed and marginal) and basic or transversal themes (important for a research field, although not developed). The evolution of these themes over

Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FoW’s Keywords Used to Search in the WoS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| TS – (‘future of work*’ or ‘future of job*’ or ‘future of employment’ or ‘future of labour’ or ‘future of labor’ or ‘smart work*’ or ‘smart job*’ or ‘job polarisation’ or ‘job polarisation’ or ‘digital workforce’ or ‘future workforce’ or ‘future of skill demand’ or ‘digital competence*’ or ‘future job competence*’ or ‘automation of job*’ or ‘job automation’ or ‘future working relation*’ or ‘future of labour market*’ or ‘future of labor market*’ or ‘electronic human resource management*’ or ‘e-HRM*’ or ‘eHRM*’ or ‘e-recruitment’ or ‘e-training’ or ‘human resource analytics*’ or ‘HR analytics*’ or ‘virtual HR*’ or ‘virtual human resource*’ or ‘digital work*’ or ‘digitalization of job*’ or ‘digitalisation of job*’ or ‘digitalisation and job*’ or ‘digitalisation and work*’ or ‘digitalization and work*’ or ‘digitalization and job*’ or ‘digitization of job*’ or ‘digitisation of job*’ or ‘digitisation and work*’ or ‘digitization and work*’ or ‘digitization and job*’ or ‘robotization of job*’ or ‘robotisation of job*’ or ‘robot*’ or ‘job*’ or ‘vulnerable worker*’ or ‘decent work*’ or ‘job automatization*’ or ‘job automation*’ or ‘automation and job*’ or ‘job automation*’ or ‘job robotization*’ or ‘robotization*’ or ‘job inequality*’ or ‘older worker*’ or ‘wage inequality*’ or ‘aging population*’ or ‘occupational change*’ or ‘digital labor*’ or ‘digital labour*’ or ‘future of the workforce*’ or ‘digital capital*’ or ‘substitutable job*’ or ‘digital Taylorism*’ or ‘spirituality and work*’ or ‘spirituality*’ or ‘spirituality and job*’ or ‘spirituality and future of work*’ or ‘spirituality and future of labour*’ or ‘leadership and spirituality*’ or ‘managing by value*’ or ‘future workplace*’ or ‘workplace of the future*’ or ‘digital transformation and work*’ or ‘digital transformation and future of work*’ or ‘digital transformation and job*’ or ‘digital transformation and human resource management*’ or ‘digital transformation and HR*’ or ‘talent management*’ or ‘knowledge management and future of work*’ or ‘knowledge management and future of job*’ or ‘knowledge management and digital transformation*’ or ‘employment* engagement and future of work*’ or ‘employ* engagement and future of job*’ or ‘new organizational forms*’ or ‘new job*’ or ‘digital HR*’ or ‘workforce analytics*’ or ‘sustainable HRM*’ or ‘gig work*’ or ‘gig job*’ or ‘crowdsourcing and work*’ or ‘on-demand work*’ or ‘crowdwork*’ or ‘digital labour platform*’ or ‘labour platform*’ or ‘labor platform*’ or ‘platform work*’ or ‘non-standard employ*’ or ‘artificial intelligence and human resource management*’ or ‘artificial intelligence and HRM*’)

Fig. 1. Science mapping steps.

Fig. 2. Strategic diagram.
time shows tendencies, such as whether they are emerging or disappearing.

2. Classification of thematic areas. The development of the research themes over time is detected and then analysed in order to identify the main general areas of evolution in the research field, their origins and their interrelationships. This enables us to recognise the conceptual, intellectual or social evolution of the field, using SciMAT to build an evolution map (Cobo et al., 2011a).

3. Performance analysis. The contribution of the research topics to the knowledge area is measured (quantitatively and qualitatively) and used to identify the most prolific and highest impact sub-fields. The number of published documents, the number of citations and the different types of h-index are some of the bibliometric indicators used.

4. Analysis of the results

Researchers have become more interested in the FoW in recent years, as reflected in the growing number of studies published in international journals (see Fig. 3). Some 2,286 articles on the FoW were published between 1959 and mid-2019. The number of publications between 2015 and 2019 (1,094 articles) was almost double that of the period 2009–2014 (see Fig. 3).

4.1. Visualising Future of Work themes and performance analysis

Four strategic diagrams representing the periods 1959–1997, 1998–2008, 2009–2014 and 2015–2019 illustrate the most important themes of the FoW (see Figs. 4–7). Sphere size is proportional to the number of published documents linked to each research theme.

In the sub-period 1959–1997, the FoW motor research theme (well developed and important for discipline) was employment, associated with organisational change and employees experiences (see Figs. 4 and 8), such as reemployment and the effects of layoffs on survivors (Brockner, 1992; Leana & Feldman, 1995). Biberman and Whitty (1997) aimed to offer a more compassionate and responsible model for the FoW and they proposed spiritual directions for the 21st century workplaces. In this sense, these authors state that 21st century leaders appreciate diversity and pluralism, and offer global servant leadership.

From 1998 to 2008, telework and new organisational forms were motor themes, and wage inequality was an emerging theme in the FoW field (see Fig. 5). Digital technologies have enabled the appearance of new organisational forms; in this sense, the identification of the pros and cons of these new forms are being gradually studied (Gajendran & Harrison, 2007; Hornung, Rousseau, & Glaser, 2008). In 1998–2008, another research theme of the FoW field was wage inequality, which covers subthemes such as discrimination, technological change and skills. Card and DiNardo (2002, p.733) stated that the skill-biased technical change cannot explain ‘the closing of the gender gap, the stability of the racial wage gap, and the dramatic rise in education-related wage gaps for younger versus older workers’ in the 90s; consequently, further research on wage
inequality is needed.

In the sub-period 2009–2014, telework, electronic human resource management (e-HRM) and wage inequality were motor themes, migrant and older workers were specialised themes, talent management was a basic or transversal theme, and job satisfaction and innovation were emerging themes in the FoW field (see Fig. 6). e-HRM notably burst in this period. These studies focus on the development of information and communication technology and human resource management (HRM) systems and the strategic value of these developments for HRM (Bondarouk & Ruel, 2010), but rarely examine their effect on HRM (Stone, Deadrick, Lukaszewski, & Johnson, 2015). In this sense, user acceptance and adoption of HR technology (Bondarouk, Schilling, & Ruel, 2016; Huang & Martin-Taylor, 2013), as well as the implementation of individual HR practices, such as web-based recruitment (Wiblen, 2016), are important concerns for e-HRM. Indeed, the role of e-HRM in collecting, allocating and studying data in order to select employees, predict employee turnover and ascertain employee competencies, to map out career plans and HR costs, or predict and evaluate employee performance, becomes crucial for the FoW, as does the importance of considering the legal and ethical aspects of these new tools (Strohmeier & Piazza, 2013).

In the period 2015–2019, wage inequality, telework, satisfaction and talent management represent the motor themes in the FoW field, which are well developed and important for this area. Employment, career and innovation are basic themes (important for the research field, but not entirely developed). Organisational commitment, older workers and corporate social responsibility (CSR) constitute specialised themes, which are well developed, but marginal for the structure of the research field. Automation, leadership and vulnerable workers are emerging themes (weakly developed and marginal to the FoW research field; see Fig. 7). As most of the FoW’s publications belongs to this last sub-period (see Fig. 3), we focussed on the profound analysis of the sub-period running from 2015 to 2019, to obtain rich and insightful results about the FoW themes and tendencies. Moreover, the performance measures analysis (Table 2) shows the number of documents, citations and h-index per theme from 2015 to 2019.

4.2. Motor themes

Talent management is a motor research theme in the FoW field (see Fig. 7), with a significant number of documents (300) and citations (1,345) referring to this theme (see Table 2). In the talent management theme, there is a growing interest in research sub-themes, such as emerging economies, multinational corporations and HRM (see Fig. 9).

As globalisation increases, the need for talent becomes increasingly important, since organisational success relies more and more on people (Glaister, Karacay, Demirbag, & Tatoglu, 2018). In this process, HRM is needed to respond to the new challenges in the employment context. Marchington (2015) claims that HRM should try to engage and develop talent among all employees. In this sense, the identification, attraction, engagement, development and retention of talented employees are necessary to obtain strategic sustainable corporate success (Collings & Mellahi, 2009).

Talent management practices are universal but more relevant in emerging economies where talent scarcity emphasises the need for
organisations to incorporate strategic perspectives to talent management (Glaister et al., 2018). The key challenge of HRM in emerging economies is to attract, develop and retain talented and experienced people who can head international activities and understand the main obstacles in these emerging markets, for instance, managing culturally and geographically various teams and engaging with different partners and stakeholders in each foreign country (Meyer & Xin, 2018). Academic interest in talent management is increasing (Glaister et al., 2018; Thunnissen & Gallardo-Gallardo, 2019).

Another motor research theme in the FoW field is telework (see Fig. 7), with 167 documents and 677 citations from 2015 to 2019 (see Table 2). The telework theme includes research subthemes, such as well-being, professional isolation, work–family conflict and flexible work arrangements (see Fig. 10). ‘Telecommuting’, ‘remote work’ or ‘distance work’ are alternatives to the term telework (Gupta, Karimi, & Somers, 1995). According to these authors, telework consists in performing work in a location distant from central or production buildings, where workers have no personal interaction with co-workers, but communicate with them electronically. Although telework is not a new term (it was coined by Jack Nilles in 1975), it is a popular and increasing alternative (Ruíler, Van Der Heijden, Chedotel, & Dumas, 2019) to the traditional work style.

The expansion of the increasing adoption of telework is explained by the development of new technologies and elements related to managers’ control and trust, job and task characteristics in knowledge intensive industries, and work–life balance (WLB) issues (Vilhelmsen & Thulin, 2016). Felstead and Henseke (2017) concluded that teleworking implies high levels of organisational commitment, job satisfaction and well-being; however, these positive outcomes come at the expense of work intensification and an increasing inability to disconnect. Conversely, Sarker, Sarker, Xiao, and Ajuja (2012) focussed on how telework creates work–life conflict and work reduction, and they proposed four strategies (compensation, negotiations, integrations and protection) for addressing these issues. Powell and Craig (2015) concluded that telework may ease women to balance or juggle work and family, although telework does not offer more time for recreational labour. Golden, Eddleston, and Powell (2017) found variations between teleworkers and non-teleworkers in terms of salary growth, but not promotions. Furthermore, Lembrechts, Zanoni, and Verbruggen (2018) found a negative correlation between task interdependence and supervisors’ supportive attitude towards telework. Ruiller et al. (2019) analysed how managers can promote the perception of proximity among dispersed team members, and they referred to two managerial styles (‘e-communication’ and ‘control’) and the key role of the e-leader. Besides, few researchers have studied the impact of telework on promotions and salary growth (Golden et al., 2017), or on the employee–supervisor relationship (Lembrechts et al., 2018; Ruiller et al., 2019). Despite this variety of studies, results across telework research are paradoxical and require further studies with explanations for contradictory findings (Boell, Cecez-Kecmanovic, & Campbell, 2016).

Wage inequality is a motor theme in the FoW field in the period 2015–2019 (see Fig. 7) and a significant number of documents (160) and citations (902) correspond to this term (see Table 2). This theme includes research concepts such as job polarisation, technological change, education and labour market (see Fig. 11). Kwon
(2014) used an interesting employment transition index to state that the shift to knowledge-based jobs is influencing wage inequality. Job polarisation is the progressive loss of jobs in sectors with average wages (Autor & Dorn, 2013). Job polarisation implies that the proportion of high- and low-skilled jobs evolves at the expense of medium-skilled jobs; these tendencies are linked to the decreased demand for codifiable or routine tasks, including both manual and intellectual assignments (Goos, Manning, & Salomons, 2014). In addition, studies of education are increasingly relevant in the FoW theme as education determines the level of technology adoption within firms (Riddell & Song, 2017). An analysis of the number of jobs at risk and the relationship between a job’s probability of computerisation, wages and educational achievement (Frey & Osborne, 2013) reveals a major concern in this field.

Satisfaction is a significant theme in FoW research (see Fig. 7), with 171 related documents and 690 citations (see Table 2). Satisfaction covers research subthemes such as work engagement, burnout, WLB, organisational justice, perceptions or attitudes (see Fig. 12). Human attributes, positive emotions and well-being in the workplace are important to address the challenges created by the
changing nature of jobs (Cascio & Aguinis, 2008; Gonzalez-Vazquez et al., 2019; Kohll, 2018). Organisations, and leaders in particular, can create an affectively committed and happier workforce. Job satisfaction has been studied as a potential source of relevant work-related behaviours, such as job performance (Judge, Thoresen, Bono, & Patton, 2001), turnover intentions (Chen, Ployhart, Thomas, Anderson, & Bliese, 2011), organisational commitment (Dirani & Kuchinke, 2011) and talented employees (Arocas & Morley, 2015). For example, Rego, Ribeiro, Cunha, and Jesuino (2011) stated that employees’ satisfaction and happiness at work and affective commitment positively affect their commitment and performance and, therefore, organisational productivity. On the other side of the coin, burnout (depersonalisation and emotional exhaustion) is a psychological syndrome, involving persistent interpersonal and emotional stressors experienced by employees at work, which define their responses (Simha, Elloy, & Huang, 2014). Burnout is a significant problem for organisations (Fernet, Gagné, & Austin, 2010), and has been connected with negative consequences (Simha et al., 2014), such as depression, absenteeism, reduced well-being, poor performance and low future work engagement (Hakanen, Schaufeli, & Ahol, 2008). Lastly, WLB strategies represent a significant antecedent of job satisfaction (Cegarra-Leiva, Sánchez-Vidal, & Cegarra-Navarro, 2012); in this sense, managers need to implement appropriate tools for monitoring levels of WLB problems.

4.3 Basic themes

Employment is a basic or transversal theme in the FoW field in the period 2015–2019 (see Fig. 7) and a significant number of documents (299) and citations (1,432) correspond to this term (see Table 2). This theme includes research concepts such as gig...
economy, precarious work, gender, industrial relations, skills and inequality (see Fig. 13). The future of employment and the threat of computerisation of many occupations have arisen an intense debate (Acemoglu & Restrepo, 2017; Frey, 2019; Frey & Osborne, 2013). The impact of gig economy on employment is also an important subtheme in the employment research theme. Gig economy refers to an economic system that employs digital platforms to link single service providers or workers with customers (Duggan, Sherman, Carbery, & McDonnell, 2019; Harris, 2017). This can be classified into remote (e.g. Fiverr, Upwork, Amazon Mechanical Turk) and local (e.g. food delivery, transport, manual labour) gig work (Huws, Spencer, & Joyce, 2016; Wood, Graham, Lehdonvirta, & Hjorth, 2019), which is offered and provided via platforms. However, according to Fernandez-Macias (2017), remote gig work is often labelled as crowdwork, while the local delivery of labour services via digital platform is labelled as gig work. Duggan et al. (2019) offer an interesting classification of gig work based upon technological characteristics: app-work, crowdwork and capital platform work. Gig economy offers autonomy and flexibility to workers, but conversely it could represent a trend towards precarious working (Friedman, 2014; Stewart & Stanford, 2017). Finally, organisations need to clearly identify the skills or competences required to adapt to the digital age (Murawski & Bick, 2017).

Career is a basic research theme in the FoW field (see Fig. 7), with 169 associated documents and 863 citations (see Table 2). This theme includes concepts such as international assignments, expatriation, global talent management (GTM), psychological contract, career development and diversity (Fig. 14). As stated by Inkson (2006), stable employment and related organisational careers are disappearing. The conception of careers has to be dynamic and
unpredictable (Brougham & Haar, 2018), but this changing nature of careers could offer opportunities (Krumboltz, 2009). The employees’ awareness of the impact of smart technology, artificial intelligence, robotics and algorithm developments has been ‘negatively related to organisational commitment and career satisfaction, and positively related to turnover intentions, cynicism, and depression’ (Brougham & Haar, 2018, p. 239). The impact of technological changes on employment will alter the nature of career planning in terms of talent, workplace opportunities or work–family choices, and will foster the importance of boundaryless careers (Brougham & Haar, 2018). In this sense, Hirschi (2018) stated that career professionals have a key role in managing employees’ labour changes, offering face-to-face or virtual services, such as learning and education (Hirschi, 2018). In this sense, international companies face significant challenges in incorporating their GTM strategies (McDonnell, Lamare, Gunnigle, & Lavelle, 2010). Dickmann et al. (2018) analysed the impact of working abroad on people career capital, and they observed that organisation-appointed expatriates learned more than self-initiated ones. Dickmann and Watson (2017) studied the reasons to accept international assignments in a hostile environment, and they presented five ideas about decision factors and career capital consequences related to assignments in hostile environments. Interestingly, Bolino, Klotz, and Turnley (2017) studied the consequences of refusing to accept an international assignment that breaches the psychological contract. Indeed, the management of careers is an important research theme in the FoW.

Innovation has been a basic theme in the study of FoW in the period from 2015 to 2019 (see Fig. 7), since a significant number of documents (175) and citations (939) correspond to this term. The innovation theme includes research subthemes such as information technology (IT), virtual HR, knowledge, dynamic capabilities and entrepreneurship. Economic, technological and competitive changes have increased the complexity and mobility of jobs and have boosted interest in creativity (Joo, McLean, & Yang, 2013). Innovation and employees knowledge can bolster a firm’s competitive advantage (Lin, 2011), as the entire organisation is in charge of
creating innovation by implementing innovation-fostering HR practices, such as the selection of qualified and creative employees, or the provision of continuous training (Lin, 2011; Ulrich, 1997). Felin and Powell (2016) analysed how organisational design can develop dynamic capabilities for continuous innovation in dynamic contexts. In this sense, HRM uses information technologies to achieve HR objectives (Bondarouk, Parry, & Furtmueller, 2017). The intersection of HRM and IT has been coined as e-HRM, which consists in a set of IT applications that include ‘all possible integration mechanisms and contents between HRM and ITS aiming at creating value within and across organisations for targeted employees and management’ (Bondarouk & Ruél, 2009, p. 507). Lin (2011) demonstrated that information technologies and virtual HR positively influence firm innovation, and that, therefore, information technologies play an important role in organisational innovation. In the era of uncertainty and technological change, the management of innovation within organisations is crucial.

4.4. Emerging themes

Leadership is an emerging research theme in the FoW field (see Fig. 7), with 52 related documents and 192 citations (see Table 2). These studies focus on concepts such as value and context. According to Dolan & Altman (2012), in today’s dynamic context, leaders’ main target is to implement an organisational culture grounded on shared values, and they present a model of values with these four axes: economic–pragmatic, ethical–social, emotional–developmental and spiritual dimensions. Spirituality at work implies that employees have spiritual needs, and seek a sense of meaning in their jobs and a connection with other people, colleagues and their work community (Ashmos & Duchon, 2000). Workplace spirituality contributes not only to individual benefits (satisfaction and commitment), but also to organisational benefits, which is reflected in the reduced absenteeism and turnover and increased productivity. It is the responsibility of leaders in the 21st century to communicate the message of their vision and values in order to enhance performance (Carton, Murphy, & Clark, 2014).

The emerging theme of vulnerable workers covers areas such as migrant workers and trade unions. According to the British Trades Union Congress, vulnerable employment refers to ‘precarious work that places people at risk of continuing poverty and injustice resulting from an imbalance of power in the employer–worker relationship’ (TUC, 2013, p. 3). Vulnerable workers experience particular circumstances such as being ethnic minorities, migrant, older or female workers, unskilled, or long-term unemployed and disabled (Burgess, Connell, & Winterton, 2013; Le Fevre, Boxall, & Macky, 2015; van Berkel, Ingold, McGurk, Boselie, & Bredgaard, 2017). In this sense, employees can feel vulnerable in their workplace due to technological or economic changes (Thompson, 2011), and there is an increasing need for academic research to identify these vulnerable employees in danger of work intensification, and its consequences for stress, WLB, fatigue and satisfaction (Le Fevre et al., 2015).

Automation is an emerging research theme in the FoW field (see Fig. 7), with 34 related documents and 51 citations (see Table 2) referring to the impact of automation and digitalisation in organisations. According to Fernandez-Macias (2017, p.4), work automation describes ‘the replacement of (human) labour input by machine input for some types of tasks within production and distribution processes’. Brougham and Haar (2018) explained how
employees scan the impact of automation on their jobs. Digitalisation explains how many areas of social life are reorganised around digital media and communication facilities (Brennen & Kreiss, 2016). Eichhorst, Hinte, Rinne, and Tobsch (2017) analysed the impact of digitalisation in the labour market, which is undergoing a huge transformation (i.e. the impact of platform economy and platform workers). Work automation, digitalisation and artificial intelligence are important organisational resources, but they need to be properly studied, measured and incorporated in organisations with the support of institutions and policies.

4.5. Specialised themes

Older worker is a specialised theme in the FoW field (see Fig. 7), with 49 documents and 181 citations relating to retirement, health and discrimination. Improvements in health and increased life expectancy are allowing older people to continue working in their later years (Pleau & Shauman, 2013). Graebner (1980) stated that older workers learn more slowly and are forced into retirement by technological developments. This has led to the coexistence of opposing trends: the possibility of extending older employees’ life expectancy, and the impact of technology on age-earnings profiles and the intention to force retirement. The rise in the number of older workers in the labour market has increased academics’ and practitioners’ interest in the management of these workforces (OECD, 2011; Van Der Heijden, De Lange, Demerouti, Heijde, 2009). In this sense, Perera, Sardeshmukh, and Kulik (2015) highlighted the need to adopt practices that engage and retain mature employees through the emphasis on flexibility, job redesign and supportive work practices in order to retain older talent and avoid intensification of the work and job dissatisfaction. Therefore, the management of age disparities within the workforce requires attention in the FoW field.

Another specialised research theme in the FoW field is organisational commitment, with 60 documents and 260 citations from 2015 to 2019. This theme includes research subthemes, such as turnover intentions, retention and trust. Organisational commitment enables talent attraction as well as powerful impacts on turnover intentions and retentions (Kontoghiorghes, 2016). The new generations, who are joining the market labour, have witnessed the appearance of the Internet, social media and environmental awareness (Naim & Lenka, 2018). According to these authors, these generations of employees need continuous competency development through mentoring, strategic leadership, social media and knowledge exchange to foster employee commitment and retention. Deng (2018) reported on how family firms can increase organisational commitment of new generations of migrant workers in China by developing family business practices, such as decent working conditions, career development and ‘familiness’ corporate culture. Thus, organisational commitment is a significant variable to consider retaining a talented workforce in order to cope with future challenges.

CSR is a specialised research theme within the FoW field (see Fig. 7), with 45 documents and 266 citations corresponding to this term (Table 2). This theme includes research subthemes, such as corporate governance, sustainability and sustainable HRM. The 2008 global crisis and persistent organisational misconduct has led to renewed attention being paid to corporate governance (Aguilera, Desender, Bednar, & Lee, 2015), a term that refers to a system of protecting ownership against behaviours that reduce its value (Huygebaert & Wang, 2012). Bello (2012) analysed the relationship between corporate governance and innovation, and stated that understanding the way in which human resources are incorporated into organisations and the coordination between team members are important for organisational innovation dynamics. Another subtheme of the CSR theme is sustainable HRM. Ehnert, Parsa, Roper, Wagner, and Muller-Camen (2016) analysed the extent to which sustainability reports may reveal prevailing models of corporate governance in the country in which an organisation is headquartered. Consequently, the study of CSR for the future of organisations is relevant and will determine organisations’ survival and sustainable development. Technological development such as artificial intelligence requires attention on social responsibility in business issues, as well as observation of legal systems to preserve privacy, transparency and security (Keenan, Kemp, & Owen, 2019).

In this sense, Medros (2019) stated that companies have an important responsibility in the future of the workforce; he added that, by acknowledging training and development and flexible arrangements as CSR actions, employers can enhance their talent pools and, concurrently, invest in their communities by providing educated workforce.

4.6. Analysis of the evolution detected throughout the different sub-periods

The keywords differ in number and lexicography in the four sub-periods: 1959–1997, 1998–2008, 2009–2014 and 2015–2019 (Fig. 15). The FoW terminology has evolved using a number of different keywords to describe the content of the documents. New topics and their associated keywords emerge in the field in the sub-period 2015–2019 (e.g. automation, CSR, vulnerable workers, leadership, international career), while other research themes are incorporated into new related themes (e.g. migrant workers, e-HRM). On the other hand, keywords such as wage inequality and telework have remained unchanged over the last three consecutive sub-periods (1998–2008, 2009–2014 and 2015–2019), highlighting the importance of technological change and its impact on employment and wages (Acemoglu & Autor, 2011). In the period 1998–2008, the term telework derived from the employment theme (see Fig. 15). Indeed, the impact of the spatial and temporal limits between work and home on the employment relationship, together with the study of the ways in which teleworking can be matched to surveillance in employment, are important challenges in this period (Fairweather, 1999; Harris, 2003). The employment theme has always underlined, being a motor theme for the periods 1959–1997 and 2015–2019, highlighting that the concern over automation and joblessness has developed into more realistic views, that is, many of the middle-skilled jobs of the future will combine routine technical tasks with non-routine tasks, in which employees hold comparative advantages, such as interpersonal interaction, flexibility, adaptability and problem-solving (Autor, 2015). Satisfaction, talent management, innovation and older workers have appeared over two periods (2009–2014 and 2015–2019), demonstrating the increasing importance of managing employee satisfaction, creativity and learning in this field. In the sub-periods 2009–2014 and 2015–2019, there is an increasing interest in employee well-being and HR leaders aim to manage issues such as vulnerability (e.g. older or migrant workers), talent, corporate social responsibility, teleworking and employee commitment based on the fact that companies operate in an increasingly global context. Therefore, according to this evolution analysis, the HRM discipline is needed to respond to these new challenges in the FoW context.

5. Categorising the future of work

What is FoW about? FoW looks far beyond the single notion of robots replacing individual jobs. According to Ballester and Elsheikh (2018) and Anner et al. (2019), the FoW concept refers to the influence of technological changes, although socio-economic or political
factors also underlie this concept. In this sense, the FoW refers to the technological, social/demographic (well-being), economic and political/institutional dimensions. Based on the findings of our bibliometric analysis, where we obtained systematic knowledge of the most prolific FoW research themes and tendencies, we can categorise all these themes into their technological, social/demographic, economic and political categories (see Fig. 16).

5.1. The technological essence of work

The technological nature of work alludes to all the changes that work is undergoing; for instance, the irruption of new forms of work (e.g. gig work, crowdwork, on-demand work, platform work) and flexible work arrangements. Automation, digitalisation and artificial intelligence are important organisational resources that are changing the working ways, roles and businesses. The emergence of new forms of work has led to a lack of conceptual clarity on the subject. The Eurofound classifies these new forms of jobs into three groups: employee-oriented, such as job sharing, casual work and interim management; self-employment-oriented, such as crowdwork, portfolio work, collaborative job, which coordinates customers with providers through virtual platforms; and mixed jobs, such as ICT-based mobile work and voucher-based work (for an overview see Mandl, Curtarelli, Riso, Vargas-Llave, and Georgiannis’ (2015) report). The concept of gig work is particularly important. Although Pesole, Urzi Brancati, Fernandez-Macias, Biagi, and Gonzalez-Vazquez (2018, p.7) consider that the term gig work has a ‘negatively loaded’ meaning, and they prefer to use the neutral term of platform worker, the popularity of the gig work’s concept is increasing. Telework is also a relevant outcome of the influence of technology on the nature of work.

To adapt to this challenges of the new nature of work, organisations require competences, such as resilience, problem solving, creativity, information processing communication, making use of big data, flexibility, readiness to learn and willingness to adopt responsibility or sociability (Cascio & Aguinis, 2008; Gonzalez-Vazquez et al., 2019; Goos et al., 2014; Murawski & Bick, 2017). These attributes will foster innovation and entrepreneurial behaviour among employees (Ratten & Ferreira, 2016) to face these technological challenges and reduce skill mismatch.

5.2. The social essence of future of work

Technological changes have a tremendous social impact on individuals and communities. The FoW deals with topics, such as job satisfaction, burnout, vulnerable workers (older workers, migrant workers, gender discrimination), work–life conflicts, talent (attraction, retention, GTM), careers (with a focus on international careers), leader’s values, CSR and organisational commitment. Indeed, the welfare state’s development together with new technologies have set individuals well-being related needs at the top of their demands. For instance, we reviewed in this manuscript how
job satisfaction has been proved as a potential source of relevant work-related behaviours. In addition, the irruption of new technology directly impacts on older workers, who often hardly adapt to these new developments. Besides, employees may experience high levels of stress or work—life conflicts as they cope with technological changes, which involves working extra hours. It is important to highlight the study of CSR and sustainable HRM for the future of organisations as a source that will determine organisations’ economic, environmental and social development. Twenty-first century leaders are responsible for communicating messages about their vision and values (Carton et al., 2014) and have to be ready for managing diversity. HRM plays an important role in managing current challenges.

5.3. The economic essence of the Future of Work

From the economic perspective, this changing nature of work is impacting employment and wage inequality and creating the job polarisation phenomenon. Many of the manuscripts related to FoW are focussed on these specific economic outcomes (Table 2). As has been previously mentioned, there exists an ongoing debate about the amount of jobs created or lost due to technological development (Arntz et al., 2016; Frey & Osborne, 2013; Hawksworth et al., 2018; World Economic Forum, 2018). In line with the employment concern, job polarisation is the progressive loss of jobs in sectors with average wages (Autor & Dorn, 2013). This phenomenon stems from the new technologies that have reduced the demand for workers performing easily mechanised routine tasks (mostly low-paid occupations), while increasing the relative demand for jobs that maintain a certain advantage over technology, either because they require greater creativity or manual or interpersonal skills (in the upper and lower wage bands, respectively; Goos et al., 2014). Interestingly, Spencer (2018) highlights that jobs will persist and that the problem will be linked to a decrease in the quality of jobs rather than to a loss of jobs. Similarly, there exists much debate aiming to explain the increase in wage inequality grounded, for instance, on alterations in supply and demand for low- and high-skilled employees (Acemoglu & Restrepo, 2017), but many other explanations appear around the rise in wage inequality (Ohlert, 2016). Undoubtedly, employment and wage inequality represent core FoW themes, where researchers could offer significant contributions.

5.4. The crucial political/institutional essence in the Future of Work

The adoption of new technology within organisations will require public institutions, policymakers and organisations to develop tailored regulations and decisions to address all these new challenges posed by the new forms of work (e.g. gig work, crowdwork), flexible work arrangements (e.g. telework), wage inequality, vulnerable workers and skill mismatch. Frey (2019) suggests some decisions, such as making greater use of wage insurance, to compensate forced employee mobility; modifying education systems to support early childhood education and lifelong learning; broadening income tax credit to enhance incentives to work and diminish inequality; or offering ‘mobility vouchers’ to support relocation in the face of the changing distribution of jobs. Indeed, all the new forms of work can offer autonomy and flexibility to workers, but conversely it could pave the road for precarious work (Friedman, 2014; Stewart & Stanford, 2017). For instance, it is necessary to clarify the real status of gig workers (Toddli-Signes, 2017), as well as fostering workers engagement (Crush, 2018). In 2017, the European Parliament approved recommendations that would guarantee basic rights for workers, regardless of the form of employment and contract, and specifically including work intermediated by digital platforms (European Parliament, 2017).

Consideration of the education and skills of employees is important. To this end, David Gruen (2017) showed how some public policy responses are coordinated with organisations, such as increased funding for schools and the teaching of skills and capabilities to enable the next generation to adapt to technological changes, and designing supportive programmes to keep vulnerable workers in the labour market (e.g. unemployed, older and younger workers and individuals from disadvantaged backgrounds or regions). These responsible interventions will improve the prospective benefits for the organisation and for the whole community. Frey (2019) appeals to decision makers to adopt decisions before it is too late.

6. Conclusions, future research and limitations

This bibliometric analysis allows us to obtain deep knowledge of the most prolific FoW research themes. Observing the last studied period, 2015–2019, themes can be ordered as motor (wage inequality, telework, satisfaction, talent management), basic
(employment, career, innovation), specialised (organisational commitment, older workers, CSR) and emerging (automation, vulnerable workers, leadership), and also FoW themes can be classified according to their technological, social, economic or political aftermath. In conclusion, although the relevant FoW literature has focussed on the technological and changing nature of work, it is also pertinent to address social, economic and political concerns, which are interrelated and complex to tackle, since FoW needs urgent organisational and political measures now, for an uncertain present and future.

The FoW has a number of theoretical implications. Studies related to the new forms of work, flexible work arrangements, telework, skills and intersection of HRM and IT (e-HRM, virtual HR, HR analytics) will provide relevant contributions to the changing nature of work. In this sense, recent studies have provided different classifications of the term gig work. However, the appearance of this new term requires more studies about the nature and consequences of the gig economy phenomenon to determine how HRM can manage these new gig employees, who usually work more independently. Research is also needed to understand telework in terms of promotions, compensation and the employee—supervisor relationship. In addition to this, determining the competences needed to respond to the changing nature of jobs and how the HRM function can enhance these competences in the digital age represents a promising future research line. Furthermore, understanding how new technological developments are affecting the happiness, stress, work—life balance, careers and talent of employees and how HRM can improve this relationship is a relevant contribution of the FoW field. For instance, more studies on the relationship between HRM, talent management and firm performance are needed. Also, further studies should focus on how HRM can contribute to the development of vulnerable workers, and what HRM practices can bolster the employer engagement towards these groups.

Regarding the practical implications, there is an urgent need to consider how digital developments are affecting strategic human resource (SHR) management (e.g. will SHR positions survive or will they also be replaced? Can the e-recruitment tools replace the HR employees?) In this sense, humans will always contribute with their competences (e.g. emotional, problem solving, creative, information processing communication, making use of big data, etc.), although an important challenge for management (in their selection and training programmes) will be to determine which competences will better fit certain current and future tasks. As we have analysed, HRM plays an important role in managing current challenges (careers, GTM, inequalities, teleworking, gig working).

We expect that the systematisation and representation of the FoW field set out in this paper will foster new research, particularly into the motor and basic themes. FoW is concerned with the management of people and not merely about robot replacements, and, most importantly, the foundation of FoW management is already underway. The main limitation of this paper is that all the papers refer to management, business and industrial labour relations. Furthermore, only WoS articles and reviews in English were considered.

Acknowledgement

This work was supported by Research Group, grant number PAID 2017SEJ602 and FEDER funds (TIN2016–75850–R).

References


Taylor & Francis Group.


